PPDC Incident Work Group

Meeting Minutes

March 31, 2016

Attendance

Michele Colopy Pollinator Stewardship Council, Inc.	Capt. Geoffrey Calvert, MD, MPH National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
Tom Delaney National Association of Landscape Professionals	Robyn Gilden, PhD, RN Environmental Health Education Center University of Maryland School of Nursing
Nichelle Harriott Beyond Pesticides	Jeanette Klopchin Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services
Valentin Sanchez Oregon Law Center, Farmworker Program	Donald Taylor Agricultural Retailers Association
Cindy Palmer American Birds Conservancy	John Peckham Pesticide & Fertilizer Management Division Minnesota Department of Agriculture
Ray McAllister CropLife America	Lacey Babnik Wild Care
Bob Rosenberg National Pest Mangement Association	Cheryl Cleveland BASF Corp
Gary Wilkinson Scotts	Will Heeb, Manager of Pharmacovigilance Bayer HealthCare
Jim Fredericks National Pest Mangement Association	Rick Kingston SafetyCall International
Margaret Jones EPA Region 5	Kaci Buhl, MS Coordinator, National Pesticide Information Center
Suntee Williams Bayer Crop Science	Julie M. Spagnoli JM Specialty Consulting, LLC
Amy McCaskill Bayer Crop Sciences	OPP people in room Melissa Panger, Nick Mastrota, Bob Miller, Rich Dumas, and Jackie Mosby

General comments

1. Rich: Next meeting will be dedicated to a discussion of approaches for analyzing the enhanced incident data on pet spot-on incidents that registrants are submitting.

2. The meeting after that will focus on discussion of results of the balloting on the importance of data elements.

3. The meeting after that will be the day before the meeting with the full PPDC.

4. Region 4 has submitted a form from North Carolina for honey bee incident reporting. We will be reviewing this when appropriate.

5. Insect pollinators include all insects that are considered pollinators, not just bees.

6. Cindy Palmer: would be useful to evaluate the pollinator incidents that have come in during the past few years, and evaluate what data elements have been useful. Melissa: we do not have a large database for this to be useful yet.
7. For reporting forms, it would be useful to have separate forms for *Apis* and non-*Apis* species.
8. It should be emphasized that effects to target species are not incidents.
9. Please submit your ranking of data elements. We will send out a standard ranking reporting form as an Excel spreadsheet.
10. Note that elements may be very important for some incident types but not at all important for others. Recommendation is to rank based on the most important incident types, but make comments on if it is not as important for some types.

Comments made on specific data elements are shown in the table below:

Insect Pollinator Incidents

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
General Fields			
Contact Information	Submitter Name	Name and title of the individual submitting the incident report to the EPA.	Some incident reporters would like to allow anonymous reporting as some (e.g. farm workers) may not feel comfortable providing their name. This would mean making this field optional, or allowing submitter to identify themselves by entering a general title (e.g., “farm worker”) when they don’t want to give their name.
	Submitter Organization	For 6(a)(2) reporting, the name of the registrant submitting the incident report. For other reporting, name of the entity (e.g., government agency, nonprofit organization, or academic institution) that is submitting the incident report to the EPA. If it is a private citizen, enter "private citizen."	OK
	Submitter Category	Category of the entity submitting the report. ("Registrant" for 6(a)(2) reports)	OK
	Submitter Address	Address of the individual reporting the incident to the Registrant or Registrant Agent.	For all contact information fields: You need to be very cautious about collecting names of individuals. CDC does not collect names and contact information of individuals (PPI) because of privacy concerns.
	Submitter Phone Number	Phone number of the individual reporting the incident to the Registrant or Registrant Agent.	OK
	Submitter Email	Email of the individual reporting the incident to the Registrant or Registrant Agent.	OK
	Report Date	Date that the incident report was prepared.	Will not be captured electronically? Submission date is automatic.

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
			Report may be prepared some time before it is submitted, so report date may be different than submission date. Make sure that you do not record duplicate records for the same incident.
	Contact Name	Contact information for a person, other than the submitter, who may be contacted for obtaining further information on the incident. This may be the complainant, a physician, a veterinarian, or a wildlife biologist.	1. You need to be very cautious about collecting names of individuals. CDC does not collect names and contact information of individuals (PPI) because of privacy concerns. 2. You may want to not capture PPI of contacts in this database, but instead rely on the submitter to hold that information. The user would then contact the submitter if when they need this private contact information. 3. You may want to restrict this to public information, such as contact information for the office of a physician's practice.
Incident Data	Incident Type	Type of incident, as defined by what was adversely affected (e.g., humans, domestic animals, fish and wildlife, bees, etc.) More than one type may be selected.	OK
	Reporter's Case Number	Non-OPP case number from submitter for the incident (if exists).	OK
	Incident Location	The location where the pesticide exposure is believed to have occurred. Location fields will include Town/City, County/Province, State, and Country.	Location data may pose a problem because of privacy concerns. For CDC cases, some incident reporters are unwilling to provide location information any more specific than the state level.
	GPS Coordinates	Latitude and longitude coordinate of the incident location.	1. Make optional. May have major privacy concerns for human incidents. 2. May not be important for human incidents as for ecological incidents. 3. May want to keep this out of the database for humans and rely on the submitter to keep this information, if it is needed.
	Exposure Date (Start)	Date of the exposure, or if more than one day, the start date of the exposure.	1. State reports usually don't include exposure date, only the incident date. 2. CDC records exposure date as well as incident date. It is important since health effects may occur well after exposure.
	Exposure Date (End)	End date range of the exposure.	OK
	Incident Date (Start)	Date of the observed adverse effects, or if more than one day, the start date of the observed adverse effects.	OK
	Incident Date (End)	End date of the observed adverse effects.	End date may not be applicable to human health incidents. The date when

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
			people no longer suffer adverse effects is generally unknown.
	Date Comment	Use to provide information about the timing of the incident when exact dates are not known. (Example: "Early April"). May also be used for comments concerning the start and end dates.	OK
	Incident Awareness Date	Date when the registrant, or registrant agent, became aware of the incident. Not applicable to non-6(a)(2) incident reporting.	OK
	Notification (Yes/No)	Indicates if the incident was reported to a government agency other than the EPA, such as a state government office.	OK, but you may also want to know if it was reported to a nongovernment organization (NGO), such as the Poison Control Center. May want to modify the description to include notification to NGOs
	Notification (Text Field)	Identifies the federal, state, or regional government office (other than EPA) that was notified of this incident.	1. The database should capture the date of notification and the case number as well. 2. Should include reporting to NGOs, such as the poison control center, as well as government agencies. 3. It would be important to know if an incident was reported to a health department.
	Part of a Study?	Indicates if the incident part of a larger study? An example is ongoing worker exposure studies.	1. Seems unlikely that you would get many of these incidents. 2. Does not seem like critical information. 3. If one answers “yes”, then you probably would want to prompt a text field to enter a description of the study.
	Status (New or Update)	Indicates if the report is for a new incident or an update to a previously submitted incident.	OK
Species and Number Affected	Species, Common Name	The common name of the species affected. May enter multiple values for nonhuman incidents.	Value automatically entered as “human” for human incidents.
	Species, Scientific Name	Scientific name of the species affected.	OK
	Number Affected	The number of persons having the adverse effect. Enter the exact number.	It was noted that a relational database structure is needed. Much of the following fields are for a single individual. Therefore if there is more than one person affected, you would need a one-to-many relationship to capture the health data for each individual affected. For bees, need to consider season when incident occurred. Also, need to account for 1) number observed dead and 2) number that did not return.

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
	Estimate	Indicates if the number entered in "Number Affected" is an estimate (yes/no).	OK
	Number Affected Minimum	The minimum value of a range describing the approximate number of persons or organisms that were observed having the adverse effect.	When the exact number is not known, the user may enter a range.
	Number Affected Maximum	The maximum value of a range describing the approximate number of persons or organisms that were observed having the adverse effect.	When the exact number is not known, the user may enter a range.
	Number Affected Comment	Text description or clarification of the number affected. This may include information on uncertainty about the number or range entered. May also provide a breakdown of the number affected by sex and/or age class (e.g. 2 adult males and 1 juvenile female).	Can be used to describe the number affected with text (e.g. “several hundred”) or to make a comment about the values entered for exact number or range.
Pesticide Information	EPA Registration No.	EPA Product Registration Number. Include the 1-6 digit manufacturer number and the 1-5 digit product identification number. Separate the two numbers with a hyphen. Distributor's number, if applicable, is entered separately.	1. The product name may be more available than the EPA Reg. No. Needs to be optional since some reporters will not know the Reg. No. 2. Product names can be ambiguous; different products sometimes have the same name. 3. The Reg No. is preferred because incident reporters do not always report the full, precise product name. 4. It is important to know the exact label of the product used because different labels may have different labels use instructions. 5. Farm workers would find it easier to record the Reg. No. than the product name. They can get the Reg. No. from the pesticide use records.
	Canadian Reg. No.	Canadian product registration number (for Canadian incidents only)	OK
	Product Name	Product name. Should include the complete trade name, including codes describing the formulation, and any description of pesticide type. Example: "Propazine 80W Herbicide"	1. Is very critical to identify the product when known. 2. The database will need relational structure to allow more than one product to be entered. 3. You may want to instruct people to enter the pesticide type when the exact product is unknown (e.g.; “herbicide” or “rodenticide.”) Alternatively, you may want to have a separate field for pesticide type.
	Product Formulation	Formulation type of the product as purchased.	OK
	Formulation as Applied	Formulation type of the product when it was applied (e.g. diluted solution, granule, dust, etc.)	OK

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
	Active Ingredient	Common name of the active ingredient to which the affected person or organism was exposed.	Will want to make the input system auto-populate or give default values when possible. For example, once you enter the product, the active ingredients should populated automatically.
	Active Ingredient Comment	Information on the identity of the active ingredient when the specific ingredient cannot be identified or is not on the drop-down list. Enter the ingredient name if known but is not on the list. If the ingredient identity is unknown, enter the known or suspected chemical class or classes (e.g., "carbamate" or "anticoagulant rodenticide") or enter "unknown."	OK
	Toxicity class	Signal word (Danger, Warning, or Caution) for mammalian acute oral toxicity class of the active ingredient.	Suggested added field. Should be obtained from a look-up table based on the ingredient ID. Do we want to record the signal word or the toxicity class (I, II, III, or IV)? Should be based on toxicity of the product, not of the active ingredient.
	Restricted Use Product	Indicates if the product is a restricted use product	OK
Application Information	Application Site Category	General category of application site (Agricultural, Residential, Commercial, etc.)	1. Consider adding additional categories, such as “Golf Course” or “Right-of-way” (We may want to add “Recreational” for sites such as golf courses, and “Municipal” or “Government” for right-of-way sites such as roads) 2. Consider adding “Labor Camp”
	Application Site	Description of the site where the pesticide product was applied. If it is an agricultural site, identify the crop. If an accidental exposure, enter the site of the exposure. If applied to an animal, enter "Animal treatment".	OK
	Application Method	Description of method used to apply the pesticide. Examples include aerial spraying, ground spraying, granular application, and bait placement.	1. Recommend being more specific on this to include the general type of equipment used (e.g. boom sprayer, backpack sprayer, etc.) 2. We may want to use Smart Label fields for this. They have has one field for general method type and a second field for more specific type.
	Application method specific	Description of the specific type of method used to apply the pesticide, indicating the general type of equipment used.	Suggested added field.
	Application Rate	Rate of the application of product, if known. Enter value and units.	1. Add “as applied” to definition. 2. Note that this is sometimes not applicable, for example with spills or pesticide loading exposure. Modify the definition accordingly.

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
	Misuse	Yes/No/Uncertain. Indicates if the manner the product was used was in violation of the label.	For human health, person reporting may not have good judgement of misuse. May not be qualified. More useful when reported by registrant or state lead agency. Question if it is worth including on form filled out by general public. May need to qualify this field as "misuse as reported."
	Misuse Comment	For misuse cases, comment on evidence indicating misuse of the product.	Important
	Applicator Certification	Yes/No. Indicates if product was applied by, or under the supervision of, a certified applicator.	OK
Incident Description	Incident Description	Description of what happened, including a general description of the suspected pesticide exposure and the adverse effects/symptoms observed. Also may include other important details not captured by the other data fields.	OK. Very important
	Incident Site or Exposure Site	Description of the site where the person or organism was exposed to the pesticide, or if unknown, enter where symptoms, mortality, or other adverse effects were observed.	Remove "or organism" for human health. Consider renaming "exposure site" Site where effects happened is also important.
	Route of Exposure	Primary the route of exposure of individuals affected (e.g., oral, dermal, inhalation, or ocular)	OK
	Exposure Pathway	The route of transport of the pesticide from the site of application to the affected organism (e.g., spray drift, run-off, volatilization, secondary exposure).	Change "organism" to "person"
Lab Report	Lab Report Title	Title or description of the laboratory report(s) that the submitter attaches or encloses with the incident report submitted to the EPA.	OK
	Lab Report Number	Report number for the laboratory report.	OK
Unique Fields for Insect Pollinators			
Weather	Weather at application	Significant weather conditions at the time of the chemical was applied.	Can link to weather.com based on location? Important
	Weather at incident	Significant weather conditions at the time of the chemical was applied.	Need to distinguish weather conditions at time of application from at time of observed effects.
	Weather source		Recommended additional field
Application Information	Time of Application	Time of day the application was made.	Make general (e.g., morning, afternoon, etc.) Time of day when incident occurred may also be important, but will often not be

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
			known. Consider adding a second field for time of incident.
Adverse Effect Information	Subspecies	Subspecies of honey bees affected (e.g., carnolian, Russian, Italian, unknown, other).	Good, but should not be
	Number of Colonies Affected	For honey bee incidents, identify the number of colonies (i.e., hives) that were affected.	Not on the original list, but I thought it needed to be added. –Nick
	Magnitude of loss	Percent of colony that was impacted.	Recommended additional field
	Magnitude of loss method	Method used to estimate magnitude of loss.	Recommended additional field
	Crop pollinator Services	Identifies if bees are used for commercial pollinator services of agricultural crops (Yes/No).	OK
	Honey Production	Identifies if bees are used for production of a honey crop (Yes/No).	OK
	Species Symptom Type	General keyword description of the most severe symptom observed in the particular species.	Should have a drop-down list of key words to keep standard terms. Include "other". Should allow multiple values to be entered.
	Adult Mortality	Indicates if significant mortality of adult insects occurred (Yes/No).	OK
	Number of adults affected		OK
	Larvae Mortality	Indicates if significant mortality of larvae or pupae occurred (Yes/No).	OK
	Number of larvae affected		OK
	Queen Bee Mortality	Indicates of loss of the queen bee occurred (Yes/No/Not assessed).	Need to also know if this was looked for.
	Dead Bee Location	Location relative to the hive where dead bees were found. (For bee kills only.)	Should be free text.
	Spray Drift	Information on how the affected insect pollinators may have (or may not) have been affected by spray drift from upwind pesticide applications. Also include information on how this exposure was determined.	Consider making more general as "site of exposure." Note: this is captured in general fields.
Land Use Information			
	Bee registry	Identify any bee registry in which the bees were registered.	Recommended added field
	Immediate Land Use	For honey bees, description of the crop or land use type at the location of the hives. For other species, description of the crop or land use type where the affected insects were observed.	For location, note that bee keepers often move bees. Therefore, bees may be in more than one location. Consider asking the last location of bee placement. Also not potential exposure from water source.

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
	Immediate Bloom	Indicates the level of bloom of a crop or of non-crop plants growing in the immediate land use area.	Probably not be applicable for non-crop areas, such as residential areas.
	Immediate Foraging	Indicates if the affected insect pollinators are suspected of foraging and/or water collection in the immediate land use area at the time of the incident. Also include how it was determined.	OK, but need to include water collection as well.
	Nearby Land Use	Description of crops or other land use classes that are adjacent to or nearby the incident site. If foraging behavior of the affected species is known, then land uses of nearby areas where the insect may have been foraging should be identified. May enter more than one value. Include how this information was determined.	Need to define "nearby." Consider collecting data by specific radii. Generally between 1-3 miles.
	Nearby Bloom	Indicates the level of bloom of a crop or of non-crop plants growing in the nearby land use area.	
	Nearby Foraging	Indicates if the affected insect pollinators are suspected of foraging in the nearby land use area at the time of the incident.	
Hive Health	Varroa Mite Load	Indicates whether bees were evaluated for the level of varroa mite load of the colonies during the last 4 months, and if so, the level of infection.	
	Nosema Infection	Indicates whether bees were evaluated for the level of Nosema fungal infection, and if so, the level of infection. Also includes description of any controls used for the fungal disease during the last 4 months.	
	Other infection	Description of any other significant infection affecting the hives, other than varroa mites and nosema fungus.	Recommended added field
	Hive treatment	Description of any pesticide and veterinary medication applied to the hive during the past four months, and what the application was meant to treat. Include the active ingredient name and amount applied.	Describe hive management as well as treatment. Distinguish between chemical treatments reported from chemical treatment identified by residue analysis.
	Incident Investigation	Provides information on any activities that are underway to investigate the incident, including analysis of samples for pesticide residues.	Indicate if investigation is preliminary or final.
	Analytical Results	Summary of laboratory results of pesticide residue and other toxicology analysis performed on bee, honey, wax, or environmental samples.	Also allow upload of documents.
Fields Filled by EPA			
EPA Fields	PC Code	PC Code(s) of the active ingredient(s) to which the affected person or other organism was exposed.	

Subgroup	Data Element	Description	Comments
	Certainty	EPA's conclusion on the certainty that the ingredient caused or contributed significantly to causing the observed adverse effects. Entered for each ingredient.	
	Certainty Discussion	A brief discussion of the evidence supporting the certainty level that EPA assigned to the ingredient.	
	Legality	EPA's categorization on the legality of the pesticide use. Legality categories are "Registered Use," "Suspected Misuse," "Known Misuse," and "Malicious Intent." ["Malicious Intent" used for intentional targeting of affected person or non-target organism.]	
	Exposure-Severity Code	Code that indicates the type of incident and the severity level of the incident.	