onceia eatriyanarayana, wib, wir m	
University of Washington	
Department of Pediatrics	
Seattle Children's Research Institute	Ad
2001 8 th Avenue	Ur
Seattle, WA 98101	12
(206) 884-1037	Wa
Sheela.sathyanarayana	
@seattlechildren's.org	RE
Committee Members:	De
Ellen Braff-Guajardo	
Patrick Breysse, PhD, CIH	
Tyra Bryant-Stephens, MD	Th
Susan Buchanan, MD, MPH	by
Stephanie Chalupka, EdD, RN, PHCNS- BC, FAAOHN, FNAP	Kn
Nancy Clark, MA, CIH, CSP	CO
Jennifer Counts, PhD	00
Joel Forman, MD	
Maeve Howett, PhD, APRN, CPNP-PC, IBCLC	rec
Gredia Huerta-Montanez, MD	an
Lloyd Kolbe, PhD, MS	sta
Sandra W. Kuntz, PhD, APRN, CNS	go
Lawrence Lash, PhD	ho
Jeanne Leffers, PhD, RN	me
Jennifer Lowry, MD	
Leyla McCurdy, MPhil	Fis
Barbara Morrissey, MS	pri
Thomas Neltner, JD, CHMM	No
Greg Ornella, MD, MS	be
Joanne Perron, MD, MPH	ref
Brenda Reyes, MD, MPH	he
Kate Sande, MS	iin
Martha S. Sandy, PhD, MPH	un
Adam Spanier, MD, PhD, MPH	

Chair:

Sheela Sathyanarayana MD MPH

December 23, 2014

Administrator Gina McCarthy United States Environmental Protection Agency 1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW Washington, DC 20460

RE: CHPAC Fish Advisory Recommendations

Dear Administrator McCarthy:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the Draft Updated Advice by FDA and EPA: "Fish: What Pregnant Women and Parents Should Know." CHPAC supports the continued update of fish advisories including the added emphasis on the health benefits of fish consumption in advisory messaging.

CHPAC commends EPA on its recent efforts to achieve long-term reductions in mercury loading to U.S. waterways through the Mercury and Air Toxics Standards, proposed effluent limitation guidelines and standards for steam electric power plants, and by supporting the U.S. government in signing the Minamata Convention on Mercury.¹⁻³ We hope these pollution source reduction efforts will translate into lower methylmercury concentrations in fish.

Fish are a nutrient rich and culturally important food but are also the primary source of methylmercury exposure in the U.S. population.^{4,5} Notably, EPA recently estimated that 2.14% of U.S. women of childbearing age have blood levels of methylmercury above the EPA reference dose (5.8 μ g/L).⁵ Thus, more than one million women of childbearing age in the U.S. exceed the EPA level,⁶ potentially placing their unborn children at risk of adverse neurodevelopmental effects.

⁶ U.S. Census Bureau. "American Community Survey. 2013 Estimate of U.S. Women Aged 15-44: Table of Age and Sex (S0101) 3-year estimate". 2013.

http://factfinder2.census.gov/faces/tableservices/jsf/pages/productview.xhtml?pid=ACS_13_3YR_S0101&prodType =table.

Children's Health Protection Advisory Committee is a Federal Advisory Committee for the

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency under the Federal Advisory Committee Act http://yosemite.epa.gov/ochp/ochpweb.nsf/content/whatwe_advisory.htm

¹U.S. EPA. "EPA Mercury and Air Toxics Standard". 2012. <u>http://www.epa.gov/mats/index.html.</u>

² U.S. EPA. "Draft Regulation: Effluent Limitations Guidelines and Standards for Steam Electric Power Generating Point Source Category". 2009. *EPA-HQ-OW-2009-0819*. <u>http://yosemite.epa.gov/opei/rulegate.nsf/byRIN/2040-AF14#1</u>.

³ U.S. EPA. "Minamata Convention on Mercury". 2013. <u>http://www2.epa.gov/international-cooperation/minamata-convention-mercury</u>.

⁴ National Research Council. "Toxicological Effects of Methylmercury". 2000. *National Academies Press*. <u>http://www.nap.edu/catalog/9899/toxicological-effects-of-methylmercury</u>.

⁵ U.S. EPA. "Trends in Blood Mercury Concentrations and Fish Consumption among U.S. Women of Childbearing Age. Final Report." July 2013. *NHANES, 1999-2010.* EPA-823-R-13-002.

Administrator McCarthy Page 2 December 23, 2014

Moreover, the burden of methylmercury exposure is likely to be greater among high fishconsuming sub-groups.⁷

CHPAC offers the following recommendations and comments on the combined FDA and EPA draft advice.

Charge 1: Should orange roughy and marlin be added to the "do not eat" list for pregnant women, breastfeeding women, and young children?

CHPAC reviewed the available published data on orange roughy and marlin⁸⁻¹⁷ and the updated FDA dataset on mercury content in fish which showed that 63% of orange roughy samples (surveyed 2002-2009) and 44% percent of the marlin samples (surveyed 1992-96) contained more than 0.50 ppm mercury.¹⁸ As a result of this broader data review, **CHPAC recommends that EPA**:

a) Include both orange roughy and marlin in the advisory in the "do not eat" group because of their high mercury and low omega-3 fatty acids content.

Further, CHPAC is concerned that consumers will assume that other fish species high in mercury, but not specifically named in the advisory, are safe for pregnant women to eat 2-3 times per week. Some of these fish, such as grouper and fresh and frozen tuna, have higher

⁷ Karimia R, Silbernagel S, Fishera N. S, Melikerba J R. "Elevated blood Hg at Recommended Seafood

Consumption Rates in Adult Seafood Consumers". 2014. International J. Hygiene Environ. Health. 217:758-764.

⁸ Health Canada, Bureau of Chemical Safety. "Human Health Risk Assessment of Mercury in Fish and Health Benefits of Fish Consumption: Appendix II: Summary data for those fish species for which samples contained total

mercury at levels greater than 0.2 ppm on average". 2007. *ISBN*: 978-0-662-47023-6. <u>http://www.hc-sc.gc.ca/fn-an/pubs/mercur/merc_fish_poisson-eng.php#appb</u>.

⁹ Unninayar CS, Ito BM. "Status Report: Mercury in the Pacific Blue Marlin *Makaira nigricans*". 1975. *NOAA*, *National Marine Fisheries Service: Southwest Fisheries Center*. Administrative Report No 2H.

¹⁰ Shomura RS, Williams F. "Proceedings of the International Billfish Symposium, Kailua-Kona, Hawaii, 9-12 August 1972. Part 2. Review and contributed papers". *NOAA ccTechnical Report*. 1974. NMFS SSRF-675.

¹¹ Shultz CD, Crear D. "The distribution of total and organic mercury in seven tissues of the Pacific blue marlin, *Makaira nigricans*".1976. *Pacific Science*. Vol. 30 (2): 101-107.

¹² Cai Y, et al. "Bioaccumulation of mercury in pelagic fishes from the northern Gulf of Mexico". 2007. *Can, J. Fish Aquat. Sci.* 64: 458-469.

¹³ Dabeka RW, et al. "Levels of total mercury in predatory fish sold in Canada in 2005". 2005. *Food Additives and Contaminants*. 28 (6): 740-743.

¹⁴ Hightower JM, Brown DL. "Mercury concentrations in fish jerky snack food: marlin, ahi, and salmon". 2011. *Environ. Health* 10:90-94. <u>http://www.ehjournal.net/content/10/1/90</u>.

¹⁵ Van den Broek WLF, Tracey D M. "Concentration and distribution of mercury in flesh of orange roughy (Hoplostethus atlanticus)". 1981. *New Zealand Journal of Marine and Freshwater Research*. 15(3):255-260.

¹⁶ Julshamn K, Mage A, Tyssebotn IMB, Sæthre LJ. "Concentrations of mercury and other toxic elements in orange roughy, Hoplostethus atlanticus, from the Mid-Atlantic Ridge". 2011. *Bulletin of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology*. 87(1):70-3.

¹⁷ Cronin M, Davies IM, Newton A, Pirie JM, Topping G, Swan S. "Trace metal concentrations in deep sea fish from the North Atlantic". 1998. *Marine Environmental Research*. 45 (3): 225-238.

¹⁸ U.S. FDA. "Mercury Concentrations in Fish: FDA Monitoring Program (1990-2010)". 2014. http://www.fda.gov/Food/FoodborneIllnessContaminants/Metals/ucm191007.htm.

Administrator McCarthy Page 3 December 23, 2014

mercury levels than albacore tuna which the advisory specifically¹⁹ limits to one serving a week (6 oz). To improve the clarity of the guidance, **CHPAC recommends that EPA:**

- b) Consider adopting a tiered consumption guide (e.g., green, yellow, and red lights) such as those used by many states. This would allow EPA to provide specific guidance for a broader number of species available in US markets. Several examples of state advisory messaging are attached (see Appendix 1).
- c) Specifically provide guidance about consumption of various species of fresh, frozen, and packaged tuna (e.g., in cans and pouches) in the advisory, not just in the supplemental Q & A, because tuna comprises a significant proportion of fish that Americans consume.²⁰

Charge 2: Based on currently available studies, is the draft advice on young children's fish consumption appropriate?

In our review of currently available literature (see Appendix 2), the highest quality studies report no consistent adverse neurodevelopmental effects in children, and several report a net benefit in neurodevelopment associated with post-natal fish consumption.²¹⁻²⁵ The body of evidence is limited, however, and does not adequately investigate the balance between the risks and benefits of post-natal fish consumption. In addition, we found worrisome evidence that consumers may respond to advisories by reducing total consumption of fish instead of switching to lower mercury fish, leading to a net reduction in the health benefits of eating fish.²⁶ In light of these concerns and the limitations of the current evidence base, **CHPAC recommends that EPA:**

a) Continue to include young children in this advisory as a public health protective measure because of uncertainties about the risks posed by eating high mercury fish.

¹⁹ U.S. FDA. "A Quantitative Assessment of the Net Effects on Fetal Neurodevelopment from Eating Commercial Fish (As Measured by IQ and also by Early Age Verbal Development in Children)". 2014 May.

²⁰ U.S. FDA. "A Quantitative Assessment of the Net Effects on Fetal Neurodevelopment from Eating Commercial Fish (As Measured by IQ and also by Early Age Verbal Development in Children)". 2014 May. http://www.fda.gov/downloads/Food/FoodborneIIInessContaminants/Metals/UCM396785.pdf.

²¹ Surkan PJ, Wypij D, Trachtenberg F, Daniel DB, Barregard L, McKinlay S, Bellinger DC. "Neuropsychological function in school-age children with low mercury exposures". 2009 Aug. *Environ Res*: 109(6):728-33.

²² Cao Y, Chen A, Jones RL, Radcliffe J, Caldwell KL, Dietrich KN, Rogan WJ. "Does background postnatal methyl mercury exposure in toddlers affect cognition and behavior?". *Neurotoxicology*. 2010 Jan. 31(1):1-9.

²³ Myers, GJ, Thurston SW, Pearson AT, Davidson PW, Cox C, Shamlaye CF, Cernichiari E, Clarkson TW. "Postnatal exposure to methyl mercury from fish consumption: a review and new data from the Seychelles Child Development Study". 2009 May. *Neurotoxicology*. 30(3):338-49.

²⁴ Debes F, Budtz-Jørgensen E, Weihe P, White R.F, Grandjean P. "Impact of prenatal methylmercury exposure on neurobehavioral function at age 14 years". 2006 Sep-Oct. *NeurotoxicolTeratol*. 28(5):536-47.

²⁵ Plusquellec P, Muckle G, Dewailly E, Ayotte P, Bégin G, Desrosiers C, Després C, Saint-Amour D, Poitras K. "The relation of environmental contaminants exposure to behavioral indicators in Inuit preschoolers in Arctic Quebec". 2010 Jan. *Neurotoxicology*. 31(1):17-25.

²⁶ Teisl M, et al. "Awake at the switch: improving fish consumption advisories for at risk women". 2011. *Science of the Total Environment*. 409:3257-3266.

- b) Carefully construct fish consumption advice to avoid the unintended consequence of reducing children's fish consumption by:
 - More strongly emphasizing the health benefits to children of eating fish,
 - Encouraging children's consumption of fish lower in mercury, and
 - Ensuring that the message is appropriate and accessible for low income, low literacy, and non-English speaking communities.
- c) Conduct a comprehensive literature review of the mercury risk and nutritional benefits of children's fish consumption using a quality of evidence rubric.²⁷
- d) Support research that strengthens the evidence base to better understand the net effects of children's consumption of fish. To reduce uncertainty, studies need to better delineate the effects of mercury exposure and beneficial constituents like omega-3 fatty acids in different fish species.

Charge 3: How should advice from local advisories for those who consume fish from local streams, rivers, and lakes be integrated with this draft advice on mercury in fish?

CHPAC reviewed many state and local fish advisories to identify how they might be better integrated with the federal advisory. Although states have traditionally focused on issuing advisories on locally caught fish, some have now started to include advice on market fish. Current EPA guidance for state fish advisories²⁸ does not align with the joint EPA/FDA advice resulting in confusion for consumers. For example, states generally follow the EPA approach to develop fish advisories on market fish (e.g., several states already recommend avoiding orange roughy and marlin when pregnant) while the EPA/FDA joint advice does not. To help assure that fish advisories are as consistent, understandable, and influential as possible across a wide range of audiences, **CHPAC recommends that EPA**:

- a) Collaborate with FDA to ensure that approaches to developing national, state, and local fish advisories provide consumers more consistent advice about local and market fish.
- b) Improve the internet navigation from the federal advisory webpage to state and local advisories webpages so that consumers can more easily access advisories on locally caught and marketed fish. For example, the advisory could link to the interactive map on the EPA webpage "Advisories where you live." EPA should work with states to fix broken links and maintain accuracy of this important link to local advisories.
- c) Review the effective use of color, graphics, icons, and professionally crafted messaging that states, local governments, and tribes have developed to communicate fish consumption advisories. These types of graphic enhancements, for both on-line and off-line materials, would improve understanding of the federal advisory among consumers and are essential in reaching low literacy populations and others who may not have access to electronic media.

²⁷ University of California, San Francisco Medical Center. "Program on Reproductive Health and the Environment: Navigation Guide". 2009. <u>http://www.prhe.ucsf.edu/prhe/navigationguide_timeline.html</u>.

 ²⁸ U.S. EPA. "National Guidance: Guidance for Assessing Chemical Contaminant Data for Use in Fish Advisories.
Volume 2: Risk Assessment and Fish Consumption Limits - Third Edition". 2000 Nov. EPA. 823-B-00-008.

Administrator McCarthy Page 5 December 23, 2014

d) Fund and provide support for states, and other local health departments and tribes to develop and disseminate advisories, tailoring messages and community engagement activities for specific populations as needed.

In addition, CHPAC notes that other environmental contaminants can also accumulate in fish and harm the developing fetus and child such as polychlorinated biphenyl compounds (PCBs) which are known neurotoxicants. In the future, EPA should include guidance on other environmental contaminants in the advisory based on the best scientific evidence available.

Thank you for your commitment to children's health.

Sincerely,

Sheela Sathyanarayana, M.D., M.P.H. CHPAC Chair

Attachments

Appendix 1: Research Addressing Fish Advisory Information Dissemination Appendix 2: Research Addressing Post Natal Fish Consumption

cc: Ruth Etzel, Director, Office of Children's Health Protection Betsy Southerland, Director, Office of Science and Technology, Office of Water Sharon Natanblut, U.S. Food and Drug Administration

Research Addressing Fish Advisory Information Dissemination

Background

Many states use EPA guidance to develop green, yellow, and red lists of fish, based on how much mercury they contain on average. Fish on the green list can be eaten 2-3 servings per week; fish on the yellow list can be eaten 1 serving per week; and the red list should be avoided by women of reproductive age and children. Figures 1 and 2, below, are two examples of guidance developed by the Michigan Department of Community Health and the State of Washington.





Figure 2. Washington State Healthy Fish Guide http://here.doh.wa.gov/materials/healthy-fishguide/24_FishGuide_E13L.pdf

Figure 1. Michigan Department of Community Health "Buy Safe Fish" Guide http://www.michigan.gov/documents/mdch/2011-05-26_-_MERCURY_ADVISORY_FLYER_STORE-BOUGHT_FISH_RESTAURANT_WEB_354266_7.pdf)

Additional Resources

Other state and local government agencies that have developed tiered guidance for the public regarding fish consumption include:

- California Department of Public, Health Environmental Health Investigations Branch: <u>http://www.ehib.org/topics/CAPhysAdvisoryChart_10_15_13.pdf</u>
- California Environmental Protection Agency, Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment: <u>http://www.oehha.ca.gov/fish/pdf/2011CommFishGuide_color.pdf</u>
- City of New York: <u>http://www.nyc.gov/html/doh/downloads/pdf/edp/mercury_brochure.pdf</u>
- Maine Center for Disease Control and Prevention: <u>http://www.maine.gov/dhhs/mecdc/environmental-health/eohp/fish/documents/meffguide.pdf</u>

Research Addressing Post Natal Fish Consumption

Cao Y, Chen A, Jones RL, Radcliffe J, Caldwell KL, Dietrich KN, Rogan WJ. Does background postnatal methyl mercury exposure in toddlers affect cognition and behavior? Neurotoxicology. 2010 Jan;31(1):1-9. doi: 10.1016/j.neuro.2009.10.017. Epub 2009 Dec 5.

Cordier S, Garel M, Mandereau L, Morcel H, Doineau P, Gosme-Seguret S, Josse D, White R, Amiel-Tison C. Neurodevelopmental investigations among methylmercury-exposed children in French Guiana. Environ Res. 2002 May;89(1):1-11.

Davidson PW, Leste A, Benstrong E, Burns CM, Valentin J, Sloane-Reeves J, Huang LS, Miller WA, Gunzler D, van Wijngaarden E, Watson GE, Zareba G, Shamlaye CF, Myers GJ. Fish consumption, mercury exposure, and their associations with scholastic achievement in the Seychelles Child Development Study. Neurotoxicology. 2010 Sep;31(5):439-47. doi: 10.1016/j.neuro.2010.05.010. Epub 2010 May 31.

Davidson PW, Myers GJ, Cox C, Axtell C, Shamlaye C, Sloane-Reeves J, Cernichiari E, Needham L, Choi A, Wang Y, Berlin M, Clarkson TW. Effects of prenatal and postnatal methylmercury exposure from fish consumption on neurodevelopment: outcomes at 66 months of age in the Seychelles Child Development Study. JAMA. 1998 Aug 26;280(8):701-7.

Debes F, Budtz-Jørgensen E, Weihe P, White RF, Grandjean P. Impact of prenatal methylmercury exposure on neurobehavioral function at age 14 years. Neurotoxicol Teratol. 2006 Sep-Oct;28(5):536-47. Epub 2006 Sep 1.

Donaldson SG, Van Oostdam J, Tikhonov C, Feeley M, Armstrong B, Ayotte P, Boucher O, Bowers W, Chan L, Dallaire F, Dallaire R, Dewailly E, Edwards J, Egeland GM, Fontaine J, Furgal C, Leech T, Loring E, Muckle G, Nancarrow T, Pereg D, Plusquellec P, Potyrala M, Receveur O, Shearer RG. Environmental contaminants and human health in the Canadian Arctic. Sci Total Environ. 2010 Oct 15;408(22):5165-234. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2010.04.059. Epub 2010 Aug 21. Review. Erratum in: Sci Total Environ. 2012 Aug 1;431:437-8.

Echeverria D, Woods JS, Heyer NJ, Rohlman DS, Farin FM, Bittner AC Jr, Li T, Garabedian C. Chronic low-level mercury exposure, BDNF polymorphism, and associations with cognitive and motor function. Neurotoxicol Teratol. 2005 Nov-Dec;27(6):781-96. Grandjean P, Budtz-Jørgensen E, White RF, Jørgensen PJ, Weihe P, Debes F, Keiding N. Methylmercury exposure biomarkers as indicators of neurotoxicity in children aged 7 years. Am J Epidemiol. 1999 Aug 1;150(3):301-5.

Freire C, Ramos R, Lopez-Espinosa MJ, Díez S, Vioque J, Ballester F, Fernández MF. Hair mercury levels, fish consumption, and cognitive development in preschool children from Granada, Spain. Environ Res. 2010 Jan;110(1):96-104. doi:10.1016/j.envres.2009.10.005. Epub.

Grandjean P, Weihe P, White RF, Debes F, Araki S, Yokoyama K, Murata K, Sørensen N, Dahl R, Jørgensen PJ. Cognitive deficit in 7-year-old children with prenatal exposure to methylmercury. Neurotoxicol Teratol. 1997 Nov-Dec;19(6):417-28.

Grandjean P, White RF, Nielsen A, Cleary D, de Oliveira Santos EC. Methylmercury neurotoxicity in Amazonian children downstream from gold mining. Environ Health Perspect. 1999 Jul;107(7):587-91.

Hsi HC, Jiang CB, Yang TH, Chien LC. The neurological effects of prenatal and postnatal mercury/methylmercury exposure on three-year-old children in Taiwan. Chemosphere. 2014 Apr;100:71-6. doi: 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.12.068. Epub 2014 Jan 23.

Myers GJ, Thurston SW, Pearson AT, Davidson PW, Cox C, Shamlaye CF, Cernichiari E, Clarkson TW. Postnatal exposure to methyl mercury from fish consumption: a review and new data from the Seychelles Child Development Study. Neurotoxicology. 2009 May;30(3):338-49. doi: 10.1016/j.neuro.2009.01.005. Epub 2009 Jan 21. Review.

Oken E, Radesky JS, Wright RO, Bellinger DC, Amarasiriwardena CJ, Kleinman KP, Hu H, Gillman MW. Maternal fish intake during pregnancy, blood mercury levels, and child cognition at age 3 years in a US cohort. Am J Epidemiol. 2008 May 15;167(10):1171-81. doi: 10.1093/aje/kwn034. Epub 2008 Mar 18.

Plusquellec P, Muckle G, Dewailly E, Ayotte P, Bégin G, Desrosiers C, Després C, Saint-Amour D, Poitras K. The relation of environmental contaminants exposure to behavioral indicators in Inuit preschoolers in Arctic Quebec. Neurotoxicology. 2010 Jan;31(1):17-25. doi: 10.1016/j.neuro.2009.10.008. Epub 2009 Oct 23.

Surkan PJ, Wypij D, Trachtenberg F, Daniel DB, Barregard L, McKinlay S, Bellinger DC. Neuropsychological function in school-age children with low mercury exposures. Environ Res. 2009 Aug;109(6):728-33. doi: 10.1016/j.envres.2009.04.006. Epub 2009 May 22.

Tavares LM, Câmara VM, Malm O, Santos EC. Performance on neurological development tests by riverine children with moderate mercury exposure in Amazonia, Brazil. Cad Saude Publica. 2005 Jul-Aug;21(4):1160-7. Epub 2005 Jul 11.

Wang Y, Chen A, Dietrich KN, Radcliffe J, Caldwell KL, Rogan WJ. Postnatal exposure to methyl mercury and neuropsychological development in 7-year-old urban inner-city children exposed to lead in the United States. Child Neuropsychol. 2014;20(5):527-38. doi: 10.1080/09297049.2013.824955. Epub 2013 Aug 25.