

Environmental Benefits Mapping and Analysis Program

Neal Fann U.S. EPA, Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards Air Benefits and Cost Group

Overview

- What is a human health benefits analysis and what purpose does it serve?
- How can BenMAP help perform a benefits analysis?
- Data inputs to BenMAP
- Demonstration of model interface and outputs
- Analytical transparency in BenMAP
- Use of BenMAP in non-US projects

What is a Human Health Benefits Analysis?

- The process of:
 - estimating of improvements in health outcomes that result from improvements in air quality
 - applying a monetary value to those improvements in health outcomes
- Benefits information can help inform the selection of optimal air regulations

Benefits Analysis



What Health Effects Does EPA Quantify?

	Particulate Matter	Ozone
Current		
Mortality	\checkmark	(✓)
Chronic bronchitis	\checkmark	
Nonfatal heart attacks	\checkmark	
Hospital admissions	\checkmark	\checkmark
Asthma ER visits	\checkmark	\checkmark
Acute respiratory symptoms	✓	\checkmark
Asthma attacks	\checkmark	\checkmark
Work loss days	\checkmark	
Worker productivity		\checkmark
School absence rates		\checkmark

Benefits Analysis



How Do You "Value" Changes in Health Outcomes?

- Cost of Illness (COI)
 - Medical expenses for treatment of illness
 - Captures the money savings to society of reducing a health effect
 - Ignores the value of reduced pain and suffering
- Willingness To Pay (WTP)
 - Lost wages, avoided pain and suffering, loss of satisfaction, loss of leisure time, etc.
 - Measures the complete value of avoiding a health outcome

The BenMAP Model

A geographic information system-based program that:

- creates population level exposure surfaces
- estimates changes in incidence of a variety of health outcomes associated with changes in certain ambient air pollutants
- places a dollar value on changes in incidence of health outcomes

The Data BenMAP Uses to Perform a Benefits Analysis



Key Features of BenMAP

- User-friendly experience
 - Driven by windows-based graphical user interface
 - Results (exposure, incidence, and valuation) available in a variety of formats including ASCII, .dbf, and shape files
- Comprehensiveness
 - Model includes a substantial population, health and air quality databases
 - Model incorporates an integrated GIS mapping, query, and statistics tool
- Flexibility
 - Enables users to perform a standardized or highly customized analysis
 - Users can add their own population, air quality, and health databases

Options for Providing BenMAP with Air Quality Data

- Model accepts user-provided air quality data, both monitored and modeled
- Provides several options for creating population exposure maps:
 - direct use of monitor or model data
 - use of model data with monitor data in a relative sense

Options for Specifying Benefits Analysis

- Preloaded with hundreds of PM and Ozone concentration-response functions from US and Canadian studies
 - Users can easily add more C-R functions with the equation editor
 - Users can add region-specific baseline incidence rates
- Model enables users to pool and aggregate incidence and valuation results
- Model estimates distributions of incidence and valuation results using Monte Carlo methods

The BenMAP Interface



Alternative Ways to Analyze Air Quality Data

- Monitor Rollbacks
 - Useful for answering hypothetical questions like: "What if PM2.5 levels were reduced by 20 percent in Mexico City?"
 - Available options include percentage reduction, absolute reduction, and rollback to standard
- Spatial and Temporal Scaling
 - Use a combination of modeling and monitoring data to project future air quality
- Monitor Direct
 - Import monitoring data jnto BenMAP

Step Two: Estimating Health Impacts

🗟 🗳 Configuration Settings

			Data										
Set	Endpoint Group	Endpoint	Metric	Seasonal Metric	Metric Statistic	Author	Year	Location	Other Pollutants	Qualifier	Reference	Race	Gender
PA PM2.5 C	·R												
EPA Standard	IC								51. T	1			
Ē.	Mortality												
÷	the state second	Mortality, All Cause											
ė.	Acute Myocardial In	25											
Ð		Acute Myocardial Inf											
1			D24HourMean		None	Peters et al.	2001	Boston, MA			Peters, A., D.W. Do		
Ė.	Hospital Admissions,												
Đ		HA, Chronic Lung Di											
Ē.		HA, Chronic Lung Di											
			D24HourMean		None	Moolgavkar	2003	Los Angeles, CA		Los Angeles Co	unty Moolgavkar, S.H. Ai		
1			D24HourMean		None	Ito	2003	Detroit, MI		Detroit, MI	Ito, K. Associations (
÷		HA, Pneumonia											
(Ē)		HA, Asthma											
٠.	Chronic Bronchitis												
Đ	Acute Bronchitis				1		- /				- /-		
٠.	Hospital Admissions,												
÷	Emergency Room V												
÷.	Acute Respiratory S												
÷	Lower Respiratory S												
1 contractions of the second s	Asthma Exacerbatio												
÷.	Work Loss Days												
(±)	Upper Respiratory S												

<

Selected CR Functions: Function Identification Function Parameters DataSet Endpoint Group Endpoint Metric Seasonal Metric Metric Statistic Author Year Other Pollutants Qualifier Reference Gender Start Age End Age Incidence DataSet Prevalence Data... Variable DataSet Location Race EPA Standa Mortality Mortality, All I D24Hourk QuarterlyMean Mean Pope et al. 2002 51 cities Pollution dal Pope, C.A., 3 30 99 2010 Mortality Incide EPA Standa Acute Myocardial Ir Acute Myoca D24Hourk Peters et a 2001 Peters, A., D. 18 2000 Incidence and None Boston, MA 24 EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 25 44 2000 Incidence and EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 45 54 2000 Incidence and EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 55 64 2000 Incidence and EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 65 99 2000 Incidence and 1 >

Run

Cancel

Previous

>

Step Three: Pooling, Aggregating, and Valuing Health Impacts

EPA Standard Valuation Functions Acute Bronchitis Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Respiratory Symptoms Asthma Exacerbation Chronic Bronchitis Hospital Admissions, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Motality Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Motality Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Motality Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 Cardio HA over 65 Cardio HA over 65 Coll: med costs +	Basic Functions tion Start Age Valuation Method Pooling Mone 0 VSL, based on rang	vlethod
 Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Respiratory Symptoms Astima Exacerbation Chronic Bronchitis Work Loss Days Hospital Admissions, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Lower Respiratory Symptoms Mortality Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Mortality Upper Respiratory Symptoms Pooling Window Name: Basic Functions Indpoint Group Pooling Window Name: Pooling Window Name: Basic Functions Indpoint Group Pooling Window Name: 	Basic Functions tion Start Age Valuation Method Pooling N None 0 VSL, based on rang	Method
 Acute Respiratory Symptoms Asthma Exacerbation Asthma Exacerbation Chronic Bronchitis Work Loss Days Hospital Admissions, Respiratory Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Mortality Upper Respiratory Symptoms Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 Cardio MA over 65 Coll: med costs + 	tion Start Age Valuation Method Pooling N None 0 VSL, based on rang	Method
 Chronic Bronchitis Work Loss Days Hospital Admissions, Respiratory Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Lower Respiratory Symptoms Mortality Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Mortality Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 Coll: med costs + 	0 VSL, based on rang	
 Work Loss Days Hospital Admissions, Respiratory Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Lower Respiratory Symptoms Mortality Upper Respiratory Symptoms Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 Endpoint Group Valuation Method Hospital Admissions, 	0 VSL, based on rang	
 Hospital Admissions, Respiratory Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Lower Respiratory Symptoms Wortality Upper Respiratory Symptoms Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 Endpoint Group Valuation Method Hospital Admissions, 	VSL, based on rang	
 Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Lower Respiratory Symptoms Woodruff et al Upper Respiratory Symptoms Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 Cardio Mathematical Coll: med costs + 		
 Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Lower Respiratory Symptoms Wondtality Upper Respiratory Symptoms Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 C. Endpoint Group Valuation Method Hospital Admissions. COI: med costs + 	U	
Hooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 Coling Window Name:	VSL, based on rang	
Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 C. Endpoint Group Valuation Method COI: med costs +	0	
Pooling Window Name: Cardio HA over 65 C Endpoint Group Hospital Admissions. COI: med costs +	IV/SL based on rand	
Endpoint Group Valuation Method Hospital Admissions CDI: med costs +	Cardio HA over 65	
Hospital Admissions. COI: med costs +	nd Pooling Method	
CDI: med costs +		
	+ 100	
Pooling Window Name: Resp HA over 65 P	Resp HA over 65	
Fordpoint Group Valuation Method	ad Realing Method	
L'applital Admissione		
Tospitar Admissions.	± 144	
	T YY	
// /		1
Adument		

Step Four: Reporting Results

Abt Configurati	onResultsGridRe	portForm						_ 7 🛛
-Column Selection								
Grid Fields:	C-R Function Fi	ields:	Version	Result Fields:	-			
Row	 Endpoint di Pollutant Author Year Qualifier Location LowAge HighAge Race Gender Other Pollut 	Averaging Time Beta DistBeta P1Beta P2Beta A NameA B NameB C NameC tants Function	Database Database Incidence Incidence2 Prevalence	Population Population Delta Mean Standard Deviation Variance Latin Hypercube Points				
Grouping Op Group b	otions y Gridcell, then by C-R	function.	Display Options Digits After [Decimal Point:]			
C Group b	y C-R function, then by	y Gridcell.	Elemer	its in Preview: 25				
Preview								
Column	Row	Endpoint Group	Qualifier	Point Estimate	Population	Delta	Mean	Stanc 🔺
1	1	Acute Bronchitis	8-12	50	3690	15	47	27
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	18-24	0	3649	15	0	0
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	25-34	0	5740	15	0	0
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	35-44	2	7669	15	2	1
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	45-54	5	5635	15	5	2
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	55-64	6	4191	15	6	2
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	65-74	6	2681	15	6	2
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	75-84	6	1342	15	6	2
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	85+	2	428	15	2	1
1	1	Chronic Bronchitis	27-44	8	12324	15	8	4
1	1	Chronic Bronchitis	45-64	6	9826	15	6	3
1	1	Chronic Bronchitis	65+	3	4451	15	3	1
1	1	Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory		38	12336	15	38	10
1	1	Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular	25-34: CO : no ICD 410	0	5740	15	0	0
1	1	Hospital Admissions Cardiovascular	35-44: CO: no ICD410	1	7669	15	1	0
1	1	Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular	45-54; CO; no ICD410	2	5635	15	2	1
1	1	Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular	55-64: CO: no ICD 410	2	4191	15	2	1 .
1	1	Hospital Admissions, Cardioussoular	65.74-CO-ma ICD 410	2	2001	15	- 1	
I								

Cancel

ΟK

Examples of Graphs Produced Using BenMAP Outputs (1) Age Group Impacts

Mortality Impacts by Age Group



Examples of Graphs Produced Using BenMAP Outputs (2) Distributions of Incidence

Cumulative Distribution of Total Change in Mortality from a 30% Reduction in PM_{2.5} Levels



Examples of Graphs Produced Using BenMAP Outputs (3) Distributions of Monetized Benefits

Cumulative Distribution of Value of Reductions in Premature Mortality from a 30% Reduction in PM2.5 Levels



Map underlying population, air quality, and incidence

rates



Analytical Transparency and Reproducibility

- BenMAP designed for public use and public scrutiny
- Published a detailed User's Guide with extensive appendices documenting model algorithms and data sources
- With each run, the user can generate an "audit trail" listing details of the run for QA and comparison with other analyses
- Consistent with Data Quality Guidelines, this "audit trail" can and should be shared with reviewers

Aggregation, Pooling, and Valuation Configuration Result: C:\Program Files\Abt Associates Inc\Configuration Results\presentation pooling example.apvr	
Configuration Results: C:\Program Files\Abt Associates Inc\Configuration Results\presentation pooling example.cfgr	
⊞ Baseline Air Quality Grid: C:\Program Files\Abt Associates Inc\Air Quality Grids\Presenation rollback base.aqg	
E- Control Air Quality Grid: C:\Program Files\Abt Associates Inc\Air Quality Grids\Presenation rollback control.agg	
Latin Hypercube Points: 10	
Pollutant: PM2.5	
- Year: 2000	
- Threshold: 0.00000	
En Selected Studies	
⊞- Moolgavkar, 2000 65-74; CO; no ICD 410	
⊞- Moolgavkar, 2000 75-84; CO; no ICD410	
⊞- Moolgavkar, 2000 85+; CO; no ICD410	
⊞- Lippmann et al., 2000 65-74; 03	
Image: Lippmann et al., 2000 65-74; 03; no ICD 410	
Elippmann et al., 2000 [75-84; 03; no ICD 410]	
Incidence Aggregation Level: State	
Valuation Aggregation Level: None	
Default Advanced Pooling Method: Hound Weights to Two Digits	
Default Monte Carlo Iterations: 5000	
Handom Seed: 3/824556U	
E Hospital Admissions, Lardiovascular (Pooling Method: Handom / Fixed Effects) (Advanced Pooling Method: Hound Weights to Two Digits)	
E [Weight: U.75, Mean: 3,057.50, StdDev: 3,195.05] Moolgavkar, HA, All Cardiovascular, 2000, Los Angeles, CA [Pooling Method: Sum [Dependent]]	
b5, 74, b5-74; CU; no ICD410, All, All, CU; TwentyFourHourDailyAverage, [exp[Beta*DELTAQ]+1]*[Incidence-Incidence2]*PUP, 1	
75, 84, 75-84; LU; no ILD410, All, All, LU, Twenty-fourHourDailyAverage, [exp[Beta*DELTAQ]-1]*[Incidence-Incidence2]*PUP, 1	
85, Max, 85+; LU; no ILD410, All, All, LU; I wentyFourHourDailyAverage, [exp[Beta*DELTAU]-1]*[Incidence-Incidence2]*PUP, 1	
E⊢ [Weight: 0.24, Mean: 9,084.97, StdDev: 5,747.26] Lippmann et al. [Pooling Method: Sum [Dependent]]	
HA, Congestive Heart Failure, 2000, Detroit, MI [Pooling Method: Sum [Dependent]]	
HA, Dysrhythmia, 2000, Detroit, MI [Pooling Method: Sum [Dependent]]	
EI- HA, Ischemic Heart Disease, 2000, Detroit, MI [Pooling Method: Sum [Dependent]]	
Valuation Pooling Trees	

Export

OK

Example International BenMAP Projects

- South Korea: Health benefits of Seoul air quality management plan
- Latin America: Benefits of air quality improvements in Mexico City, Saõ Paulo, Santiago
- India: Benefits analyses in Mumbai and Pune of alternate air quality policies

Using BenMAP International

- Program components users must modify:
 - Baseline and projected population data
 - Monitoring data (if applicable)
 - Valuation function library
- BenMAP components users should consider modifying:
 - Concentration-response function library
 - Baseline and projected incidence rates
 - Income growth adjustment functions



Derivation of Effects Estimates



Epidemiology studies – derivation of concentrationresponse functions (beta values)

• Valuation Procedures (I) WTP reflects individuals' preferences

- Market goods e.g., buying a new automobile
- Non-market goods e.g., health-related improvements in environmental quality
- WTP for a non-market good difficult to estimate
 - Decrease the risk of a day of coughing
 - Decrease the risk of admission to the hospital for respiratory illness
- Benefits analysis estimates the value of a statistical health problem avoided
- Reduction in air pollutant concentrations results in a reduction in mortality risk

Valuation Procedures (II)

- EXAMPLE: Value of a statistical life saved
 - I µg/m³ reduction in pollutant concentration produces decrease in mortality risk of I/I0,000
 - For every 10,000 individuals, one individual would be expected to die in the absence of the reduction in PM concentrations
 - WTP for this 1/10,000 decrease in mortality risk is \$500
 - Value of a statistical life is 10,000 x \$500 = \$5 million
 International benefits transfer between countries